UNITED
NATIONS

A

General Assembly

Distr.
GENERAL

A/CONF.189/PC.1/10
8 March 2000

Original: ENGLISH

WORLD CONFERENCE AGAINST RACISM,
RACIAL DISCRIMINATION, XENOPHOBIA
AND RELATED INTOLERANCE

Preparatory Committee
First session
Geneva, 1-5 May 2000

Item 6 of the provisional agenda

PREPARATORY MEETINGS AND ACTIVITIES AT THE INTERNATIONAL, REGIONAL AND NATIONAL LEVELS

Note by the Secretary-General

transmitting the report of the Consultation on the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance held in Bellagio, Italy, 24-28 January 2000

GE.00-11500 (E)

BELLAGIO CONSULTATION

Report of the Consultation on the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Forms of Intolerance held at The Rockefeller Foundation's Study and Conference Center Bellagio, Italy,

24-28 January 2000

Introduction

1. This report is submitted pursuant to paragraph 35 of General Assembly resolution 53/132 and paragraph 37 of General Assembly resolution 54/154. The Bellagio Consultation on the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Forms of Intolerance was convened by Gay J. McDougall, a member of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination and Executive Director of the International Human Rights Law Group (Washington, D.C.), with the support of The Rockefeller Foundation. The purpose of the Consultation was to bring together a diverse group of experts from around the world to formulate recommendations on the forthcoming World Conference Against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, which will be held in South Africa in 2001.

2. This report seeks to provide a synthesis of the discussions that took place during the Consultation. It sets out the recommendations that were developed by the participants relating to the core themes and possible outcomes of the World Conference. It also advances several recommendations relating to the World Conference process and format, with particular emphasis on the need for World Conference participation by those who are most affected by, or have an impact on racism and racial discrimination. The recommendations, which are contained in Part III of this report, were developed in the hope that they might be useful to the Preparatory Committee for the World Conference, as well as to Governments, non-governmental organizations and other interested parties involved in the World Conference.

Overview

3. The World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance will not only be an important global event, it will also motivate a critical process, through which a global consensus can be built for the articulation and implementation of new and effective approaches to eliminating racism. The World Conference can have a significant and long-lasting impact at the international, regional, national and local levels. Indeed, for those groups, communities and individuals most affected by racism and discrimination, the World Conference has the potential to affect their lives and life-chances in a most profound way.

4. To realize this enormous potential, the World Conference against Racism must adhere to the United Nations resolutions which call for it to focus on practical and action-oriented strategies, concrete and specific commitments, and measurable and achievable goals. The World Conference must also identify the mechanisms and resources necessary to implement the strategies and plans of action. The Bellagio Consultation and the recommendations contained in

this report are efforts to ensure that the World Conference against Racism lives up to its potential and promise to make a major contribution to the struggle against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.

5. The Consultation was not intended to undertake an exhaustive and in-depth analysis of the myriad forms and manifestations of racism and intolerance around the world. Its focus was on developing recommendations and proposals for a successful and significant World Conference. This forward-thinking agenda was, however, grounded in a comprehensive analysis of historical and contemporary patterns of racism and racial discrimination, including the causes and consequences.

6. Accordingly, Part I of this report places the Consultation's discussions in context. It reflects comments made by participants but draws primarily on an analysis of racism, and of the denial of racism, conducted by another group of experts in a previous meeting convened in December 1999 by the International Council on Human Rights Policy.[1] Part II contains a summary of presentations made during the Bellagio Consultation on selected issues, including globalization, immigration, ethnic conflict, indigenous peoples, recourse and remedies through legislation and litigation (the United States example), and the role of national institutions. Part III of this report sets out the recommendations of the Bellagio Consultation with respect to (a) the themes of the World Conference, (b) action and activities, (c) World Conference participation, and (d) the regional preparatory process.

PART I. THE NATURE OF RACISM

7. It was noted from the outset that the concept of "race" is a social construct that is frequently used for political ends. The overwhelming weight of authority proves that as a scientific and anthropological matter, the notion that people can be definitively categorized and classified into different "races" is a myth. There is only one race - the human race.

8. It is also abundantly clear that there is no one form, type or definition of "racism" or "racial discrimination". However, for the purpose of the Bellagio Consultation and this report, "racial discrimination" is defined, in accordance with article 1.1 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination ("Race Convention" or "Convention"), as follows:

> "Any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, colour, descent, or national or ethnic origin which has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing the recognition, enjoyment or exercise, on an equal footing, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural or any other field of public life."[2]

9. Racism (and racial discrimination) exists and persists, to some degree, in all societies and in every country and region around the world. The ways in which racism manifests itself and is perpetrated vary across cultures, contexts and historical eras - as must the strategies to combat racism.

10. Racism is ubiquitous, though not necessarily visible at the level of social behaviour. Indeed, the very existence of racism is widely denied across cultures, countries and regions.

This phenomenon of denial makes recognizing, identifying and effectively addressing racism particularly difficult. Denial operates on many levels, including even the language that is used to describe certain situations. Terms like "ethnic minority", "ethnic conflict", "immigration restrictions", "new immigrant", "illegal alien", "urban poor" and "colour-blindness", are used to deny or obscure the racist aspects of certain social behaviours or government policies.

11. In addition to blatant and covert acts and denials, racism can be manifested in attitudes (opinions, beliefs and stereotypes); ideologies; inter-personal relationships; social practices; and institutions. Institutional racism, in which patterns of discrimination, marginalization and disadvantage become systematic and self-sustaining, is particularly problematic in that it is often considered simply "the way the system works" - which is at once the truth *and* an obfuscation of both the underlying problem and the possible solutions.

12. Racism is a tool to gain and maintain power. A significant cause (and effect) of racism in the world today stems from colonialism and slavery, the results of which include the often near-total exploitation, dispossession and dislocation of certain groups of people (or of peoples); misappropriation of their land and resources; and denial of their very humanity. The continuing legacy of colonialism and slavery is evidenced in many places and in many ways, some more obvious than others. Slavery has not yet been eradicated, either in its traditional forms, or in more contemporary forms, such as internal and cross-border trafficking in persons. The levels of economic and technological development of nations, peoples and groups of people, continue to develop largely along racial lines that have been drawn by colonialism and slavery - a further testament to the lingering effects of historical inequities and injustices.

13. Racism is inextricably linked with socio-economic factors. Racism is frequently an expression of underlying socio-economic inequalities, and in many societies, issues of race and socio-economic class are often conflated. Most of the world's poor are people of colour. Groups that face racial discrimination are denied access to land, wealth, employment, education, health and social services, law enforcement protection, and protection of their environment. The poor are often described in racist terms and blamed for their own deprivation.

14. Racism permeates the current patterns of economic globalization. The fusion of markets, economies and nation-States, as it is currently taking place, serves to increase the divide between rich and poor (nations and people). It exacerbates institutional and entrenched racism, while creating new patterns of exclusion and marginalization. The vast and rapid movement of capital, resources and technology is encouraged and under-regulated, while the concomitant movement and migration of people is severely restricted. Xenophobia and discrimination against immigrants is an increasingly widespread and common aspect of many societies and policies.

15. Racism relates to issues of ethnicity and ethnic identity - the political manipulation of which has led to internal and cross-border ethnic conflict, including "ethnic cleansing" and genocide. Racism also relates to the issues facing indigenous peoples, who are subjected to gross and systematic discrimination in every region of the world.

16. Racism is linked with other forms of discrimination and intolerance. Every human being has multiple bases of identity, including race, colour, ethnicity, national or linguistic origin, class, caste, gender and sexual orientation. Racism compounds the various other forms of

discrimination a person or group may face. There are also hierarchies constructed *within* racial groups on the basis of skin colour or language, for example. Thus, racism can be internalized, resulting in discrimination against members of the same racial group. The fact that a person is a victim of racial discrimination does not mean that she/he cannot also be a perpetrator.

PART II. PRESENTATIONS ON SELECTED ISSUES

17. The many complexities and subtleties of racism - how it is structured and manifested, and how it survives and mutates - are beyond the purview of this report and the Bellagio Consultation. However, as a point of departure for developing recommendations for the World Conference against Racism, several participants were asked to make brief presentations on selected issues, including globalization; immigration; ethnic conflict; indigenous peoples; recourse and remedies through legislation and litigation (the United States example); and the role of national institutions. The presentations and the remarks made in the subsequent discussions are summarized below.

Globalization

18 Globalization is one of the main features of modern society and has a major impact on racism. It is characterized by the integration or fusion of economic markets in ways that transcend nation-States. The key drivers of globalization are free-market capitalism and competition, privatization and deregulation, and the maximization of profit.

19. Globalization is not inherently evil and does not *have* to perpetuate racism and discrimination. Indeed, the spread of information technology, which is a key feature of globalization, can provide great educational benefits to marginalized groups and peoples. The opening up of markets can provide economic and employment opportunities and promote development. For globalization to have a proactive and positive impact on racism, however, the profit-driven interests of the private sector must be tempered by State and corporate responsibility.

20. Globalization makes possible the transfer and concentration of enormous wealth into the hands of a few, mostly private corporations, thereby increasing the divide between the rich and the poor. It also increases the digital divide as rapidly developing technologies, such as the Internet, remain accessible to only a privileged few. These economic and digital divides, not surprisingly, occur along colonialism's fault lines: North/South and White/Black. The economic, political and cultural dominance of North America and Europe is maintained, as is the exclusion, marginalization and exploitation of countries and peoples in the rest of the world. At present, the benefits of globalization are by no means globally shared.

21. Globalization is monopolized by the private sector, the primary aims of which, profit and the accumulation of wealth, are often inimical to the aims of good governance through social justice and equity. While aggrandizing the private sector, globalization reduces the role of the State, or rather States abdicate responsibility for regulating the conduct and activities of transnational and national corporations, foreign investors and other non-State actors. The responsibility of the State is clear, as globalization happens as a practical matter through laws and policies at the national level. This is an important point in addressing the phenomenon of

the "race to the bottom", in which poorer countries compete for private investment by lowering their standards, including environmental regulations and social protections that the investors would be subject to in their home countries.

22. Another aspect of globalization involves intellectual property rights. Private corporations are appropriating what were once "common" or freely-accessible resources, such as seeds and extracts from medicinal plants, and turning them into privately-owned commercial products over which the corporations have exclusive rights of use and distribution. Patented medicines, such as treatments for HIV/AIDS - which is now so widespread in Africa and other poor areas of the world that it undermines development and social stability - are priced out of reach for millions of people who desperately need them.

23. Globalization exacerbates the structural, institutional and entrenched patterns of racism that exist within and between countries and regions. Further, it creates new patterns of exclusion, marginalization and exploitation. The excluded are mostly the poor, the black and the formerly-colonized. Their lands, resources and labour are exploited with little gain to them. They lack access to wealth, economic and investment opportunities, employment and safe working conditions, education, information technology, environmental and other legal protections, health care, social services, political power and influence in international affairs and arenas. The excluded are also threatened with the loss of their culture and identity, as society becomes more dominated by the homogenizing effects of globalization.

24. The costs of such exclusion are high, even in purely economic terms. Human, natural and cultural resources are wasted, and potential consumer markets are lost. Cycles of poverty and degradation create resentment, which can lead to diminished productivity and costly violence and conflict. Sustainable economic development will not be possible without global inclusion.

25. Globalization highlights the importance of involving a range of actors and sectors of society in developing a plan of action to address racism and racial discrimination. The role of the State, private corporations and affected communities are all critical, as is the role of multilateral institutions, such as the World Trade Organization and the World Bank. Until recently, the World Bank and other regional and international financial institutions have strongly supported globalization and free-market economics, without due regard to the negative effects on developing countries in general, or on excluded people(s) in such countries in particular. However, institutions like the World Bank have begun to realize both the ethical and economic imperatives of addressing the deleterious effects of unrestricted globalization driven solely for profit.

Immigration

26. While the vast movement of capital, goods and resources is promoted and facilitated by States, the movement of people, generally from poorer areas, countries and regions to richer ones, is strongly resisted, strictly regulated and sometimes even criminalized. Global migration is nonetheless increasing, as is racial discrimination against immigrants, migrant workers, refugees, asylum-seekers and displaced persons.

27. Immigrants are often made the scapegoat for the ills of society, in particular the socio-economic problems of their "host" country. Anti-immigrant bias and xenophobia are frequently propagated by the media and opportunistic political leaders, and are evidenced in restrictive (and racist)[3] immigration policies that curb the flow of certain groups of people, primarily people of colour. For example, in affluent Western Europe, there has been an increasing tendency to formally group "aliens" into three levels of "desirable" immigration: migrants from the European Union and the European Free Trade Association (EFTA) countries, migrants from North America, and the rest. While it is argued that there is no racist intent behind these policies, their effects are obvious - white workers from the rich Western countries are welcome, while people from the developing world are excluded.

28. Migrant workers, such as miners, seasonal workers and domestic servants, are often at the mercy of their employers and are treated as commodities, attracted when needed and expelled when no longer required. In many cases, women migrants are subjected not only to racial discrimination, but also to discrimination and abuse on the basis of their gender. Even if recourse mechanisms are formally available, they may be ineffective because to resort to them would invite retaliation. Children of migrant workers are often without meaningful rights or protections as well.

29. The situation of undocumented ("sans-papiers") migrants is even more difficult. They usually belong to ethnic groups different from the "host" community, and are excluded and discriminated against, not just because of their undocumented status, but because of their ethnicity. They are frequently characterized as "illegal aliens" (although only certain activities, not people, can ever be "illegal"), which is then used as a justification for denying them their fundamental human rights and freedoms, including access to education and basic health and social services. The International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, as of December 1999 (nine years after its adoption), has only 12 ratifications and has not yet entered into force, mainly because it includes protections for undocumented as well as documented migrants.

30. It is estimated that there are at least 80 million international migrants in the world. As stated in article 1 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights: "All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights". This does not change when a person moves from the place of her/his birth.

Ethnic conflict

31. The most publicized contemporary ethnic conflicts have taken place in the former Yugoslavia and in Africa. However, ethnic conflict is a global phenomenon. Three sets of factors that can be discerned in analysing ethnic conflicts are: historical factors, predisposing factors and triggering factors. One major historical factor is colonialism, which created arbitrary boundaries in colonized territories, artificially dividing population groups, separating communities from basic resources like water and generating "reservoirs of hostility" between ethnic groups who received disparate treatment under colonial rule. The end of the cold war has also returned issues of ethnic conflict to centre stage in Europe.

32. Factors which create a predisposition towards ethnic conflict include demographic factors, such as ethnic composition, migration flow and marriage patterns; socio-economic conditions and relations, such as divisions of labour, disparities in income, and unequal distribution or concentration of resources; political power and representation factors, such as the distribution of State portfolios along ethnic lines, disparities in political representation and participation, and promotion of a mono-ethnic national identity; and cultural factors, such as religion and the media. Typical triggering factors of ethnic conflict are the failure to satisfy the legitimate claims made by ethnic groups for recognition of their separate identity, or the failure to recognize their claims for a fair share in the power and wealth of the country.

33. The historical, predisposing and triggering factors and conditions can often give warnings of potential ethnic conflict. These warnings must be heeded and mechanisms should be established for intervention and prevention at the international, regional and national levels. Also important is a mechanism to undertake ongoing risk assessments and to monitor conditions and trends in areas where ethnic conflict has erupted in the past.

Indigenous peoples

34. Over the past decade, the issue of indigenous peoples has gained in visibility, particularly at the international level. This is due in large part to the growing activism among indigenous peoples, who have been able to achieve the establishment of procedures and forums for international cooperation. They also have had increasing success in accessing and utilizing various international mechanisms, such as the Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights, the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, the International Labour Organization and the World Bank.

35. However, it is still the case that indigenous peoples in their own countries and regions are among the most marginalized and excluded groups. In some countries, the very existence of indigenous peoples is denied. In many countries, indigenous communities are dealt with in a paternalistic fashion as "the poor", and the racist implications of this treatment is obscured or ignored.

36. A major obstacle to the full realization of equality and inclusion by indigenous peoples is the fact that their most important demands relate to collective rights, including the right to land and resources, to self-determination and autonomy, to development and to practise their culture. Over the past 50 years, the international regime for the promotion and protection of human rights has largely focused on individual rights, leaving the jurisprudence of collective rights comparably under-developed. There needs to be increased attention paid to collective rights at the international, regional and national levels.

37. It is also important that issues concerning indigenous peoples are not only addressed as a distinct and separate category, but are fully integrated into the discourse on racism and racial discrimination. This is necessary in order for effective responses to be developed which address institutionalized racism, globalization, immigration, colonialism, slavery, civil conflict and internalized racism - as they pertain to indigenous peoples.

Recourse and remedies: legislation and litigation (the United States example)

38. The United States has comprehensive laws on racial discrimination, some of the most important of which date back to 1866. These laws are strong on civil and political rights, but do not address economic rights. While the United States example cannot be easily transposed elsewhere, it can be usefully examined to illustrate the factors that make legal frameworks prohibiting racial discrimination effective or ineffective. What is clear from the United States example is that "good laws" are not enough. In order to be effective, several additional factors must be in place.

39. First, the costs and penalties associated with acts of racial discrimination must be significant enough, but not exorbitant, to constitute effective deterrents to the practices. If the penalties for discriminating are unrealistically high, there will be reluctance in applying them to the perpetrator(s). If the penalties for discriminating are predictable and minimal, they will be figured into the "cost of doing business". Thus in United States employment discrimination cases, employers may be willing to risk having to pay an employee's lost wages, but may be deterred by the prospect of punitive damages awarded by a jury.

40. Second, in attempting to change patterns and practices through a litigation strategy, it is important to target the best defendant: the person (or entity) most accountable for the discrimination, or most able to effectuate change. In certain cases, this means that a plaintiff must be able to sue the Government.

41. Third, those who impose the penalties for discrimination should not be solely persons from the group which derives privileges and benefits from the discrimination, or from the system that supports the discrimination. For instance, early United States discrimination and civil rights cases were decided by judges who identified with, and thus sided with the defendants.

42. Fourth, there must be an adequate infrastructure for handling the discrimination cases, including a sufficient number of trained lawyers with sufficient resources and incentives to carry on their work. Such incentives include the possibility of winning attorneys' fees, while not being liable for opposing attorneys' fees in unsuccessful cases, and the possibility of filing class-action suits on behalf of a number of plaintiffs.

43. And fifth, there must be a way to collect admissible evidence of the discrimination. In the United States, professional "testers" will solicit companies or organizations for goods, services or opportunities to show that they are being offered to some people and not to others. The disparate results can then be used in courts of law against the companies or organizations.

44. Even with "good laws" that can be implemented effectively, the limitations of legislation and litigation must be recognized. Racism cannot be eradicated solely by "outlawing" it. Any regulation, prohibition, punishment or recourse for victims, at the national or international level, will only address the manifestations of racism, not its underlying causes nor most of its consequences. Legal, judicial and administrative responses to racism must be complemented by political and socio-economic responses, including those aimed at addressing the root causes of racism.

The role of national institutions

45. National institutions, including human rights commissions and ombudspersons, can play a vital role in ensuring compliance with national and international standards and norms, and in combating racism and racial discrimination. To be effective, however, several requirements must be met.

46. The members of the institution must be representative of the population which they serve, and they must be allowed to determine their own priorities. The institution must be impartial and independent, with safeguards to protect both its credibility and its independence. It must have a broad mandate that allows for effective action, as well as adequate resources to carry out its work.

47. It is difficult, if not impossible, for a national human rights institution to operate effectively in non-democratic systems, such as countries under military rule. The institution should be able to observe and monitor the implementation of the standards it sets. It should be visible and accessible to its constituency, at no or little cost, and should be centrally involved in public education and awareness-raising. The distinction between the national institution and the courts should be clear and, accordingly the institution should issue recommendations as opposed to judgements. It should, however, be able to initiate inquiries and compel cooperation and assistance as necessary.

PART III. RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BELLAGIO CONSULTATION

48. This section of the report is a synthesis of the proposals and suggestions made during the Bellagio Consultation. It is divided into four sets of recommendations relating to: A. Themes of the World Conference; B. Action and activities; C. World Conference participation; and D. The regional preparatory conference.

A. Recommendations on the themes of the World Conference

A slogan for the World Conference

49. The World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance needs to have a central, unifying and positive message that captures and promotes the ideals and purposes of the conference. In order to be effective, the message should be short and simple, and easily translated into various languages. The message must also be relevant to, and have resonance with, various cultures, countries and regions. Of the many suggestions made during the Bellagio Consultation, the following proposed central themes were selected:

"All different, all equal: Combating racism together"

or:

"Combating racism: Equality, diversity and justice"

Core themes of the World Conference

50. United Nations resolutions on the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance have called for the conference agenda to be action-oriented, in order for practical strategies to be developed and for real, concrete results to be achieved. Using as the point of departure the objectives of the World Conference, as stated in resolution 1997/74 of the Commission on Human Rights, recommendations on the conference agenda were made and synthesized during the Bellagio Consultation. The following core themes are proposed topics for working groups at the World Conference.

Theme 1: Forms and manifestations of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and intolerance

Sub-issues:

Sources, causes and contributing factors of racism:

The legacy and contemporary forms of colonialism and slavery;

Economic globalization, disparate patterns of development and discriminatory socio-economic policies;

Multiple bases of identity that compound discrimination, such as gender and class;

Entrenched institutional, structural and systemic racism, including persistent disparities in socio-economic development and in political representation and participation;

Xenophobia and discriminatory national immigration policies;

Discrimination based on skin colour;

Ethnic conflicts;

Caste systems;

Religious intolerance;

Hate speech and hate crimes;

Racism in law enforcement and criminal justice systems.

Theme 2: Victims of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Sub-issues:

Indigenous peoples;

Ethnic, national, religious and linguistic minorities;

"Excluded majorities" (such as Afro-Brazilians or Black South Africans under apartheid);

Migrants, refugees, asylum-seekers and displaced persons;

Groups subject to discrimination on the basis of descent (such as the Dalits and the Burakumin);

People of colour in the Americas.

Theme 3: Remedies, recourse, redress and compensatory measures

This core theme would examine ways to address persistent patterns and individual violations involving racial discrimination, including measures at the international, regional, national and local levels.

Sub-issues:

Legislative, regulatory and administrative responses;

Judicial responses;

Political responses;

Socio-economic responses;

Law enforcement and criminal justice system reform;

Special measures and affirmative action;

Reparations.

Theme 4: Strategies to achieve full and effective equality and accountability

This core theme would focus on measures aimed at prevention, promotion and protection, and would involve an examination of how to address the underlying causes and consequences of racism.

Sub-issues:

Achieving full implementation of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination;

Creating effective early warning mechanisms;

Establishing the accountability of non-State actors, including the corporate and financial sectors;

Assessing the costs of exclusion and the benefits of diversity;

Guaranteeing full, effective and equal political participation and self-determination;

Promoting economic, social and cultural rights;

Addressing social behaviour, attitudes, cultural stereotypes and interpersonal discrimination;

Strengthening the role of Governments in promoting diversity, multi-culturalism and tolerance;

Building the capacity of national institutions, non-governmental organizations and civil society to combat racism;

Bridging the "digital divide" by promoting broad-based access to information technology;

Using education, information technology, communications and media to prevent racism and intolerance;

Monitoring and measuring progress.

B. Recommendations for action and activities

51. The participants at the Bellagio Consultation formulated a series of ideas for possible action and activities relating to the themes, possible outcomes and other aspects of the World Conference against Racism. The criteria used in generating these ideas were that they should be practical, concrete and innovative, and that they should have broad-based impact and importance. In addition, the action or activities could occur at the international, regional, national or local level, and could occur before, during or after the actual event in 2001.

52. The format used to develop each idea was to set out the concept, the rationale behind it, the practical steps towards implementation and the implementing partners, or those actors, institutions and mechanisms necessary for carrying out the idea.

Pre-Conference Activities:

The convening, by the Secretary-General of the United Nations, of a series of high-level consultations, including:

> A meeting with the Presidents of all the multilateral and regional development banks, with a view to: (i) issuing a joint statement, to be read at the opening of the World Conference, which speaks to the economic costs of racial

discrimination and exclusion, and pledges a review and evaluation of all institutional programmes and decisions for racial discrimination; (ii) establishing an inter-agency task force on racism and racial discrimination, comprised of high-level representatives of each bank, that would undertake activities in support of the World Conference, including regional research studies and expert meetings and seminars; and (iii) securing a commitment from each bank to assist in funding the World Conference;

A summit with high-level figures of the world's major religious communities, with a view to issuing the equivalents in each faith of an edict on racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, thereby affirming that combating racism is also an issue of faith;

A meeting with the top executives of the world's major Internet providers, with a view to adopting a voluntary code of conduct and guidelines on hate speech and hate propaganda on the Internet;

A meeting with the top media executives, with a view to obtaining their commitment to be "implementing partners" in a global media campaign to combat racism and to publicize the World Conference.

The launching of an aggressive media campaign at the national and international levels, using television, print and radio. The campaign could include 30-second spots (or "public service announcements") and print advertisements on the topic of racism and the World Conference, as well as a special programme on the International Day against Racism, 21 March 2001. Several international and national networks, such as CNN, the BBC and comparable French, Spanish, Russian, Chinese, Arabic and Portuguese language media outlets, could agree to broadcast for free. Local media providers and networks, including community radio stations, could also be approached for their services.

The development of a global on-line school audience and network for a multi-cultural and anti-racism curriculum, thereby extending the benefits of information technology while using the Internet to promote tolerance and combat racism. One hundred target communities in technology-poor regions and countries could be identified and corporations could be approached to donate the resources, equipment and training necessary to connect schools in those communities to the Internet. An on-line programme could be offered to schools around the world on a weekly basis, starting in spring 2001, and contributions from the students (stories, statistics, surveys), could be posted on-line. The live webcast of the World Conference in South Africa could include on-line hosts to facilitate interaction and allow the various schools to experience the conference.

Conference commitments on actions to be taken:

To formulate national plans of action to combat racism, which, like the global plan of action in the final World Conference document, should include specific and measurable

goals; targets, benchmarks and indicators to measure progress; timetables for achieving objectives, and identified resources and mechanisms for implementation and monitoring compliance;

To strengthen the capacity of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination to monitor compliance with the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. This would include allocating increased resources to facilitate regular in-country visits, consultations with regional and national bodies, and technical assistance to States parties in producing their reports to the Committee;

To appoint a United Nations inter-agency task force on racism, focusing on mainstreaming a programme of action against racism throughout the United Nations system (including all field operations), developing institutional policies and initiatives to combat racism, and promoting the recommendations and plans of action coming out of the World Conference. The task force would be comprised of high-level representatives from UNDP, UNIFEM, UNICEF, UNESCO, Habitat, ILO, UNHCR, and other relevant bodies;

To establish a semi-autonomous United Nations body that would promote research and conduct training programmes on racism-related issues. The research and training centre would publish studies, compile statistics, maintain databases and develop qualitative and quantitative indicators to measure international, regional and national progress in the struggle against racism;

To establish, with the technical assistance of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, operational units within regional organizations, such as the OAS, OAU and ASEAN, which would focus on combating racism in the region, and which would be similar to the units that currently exist within the Council of Europe;

To create a United Nations voluntary trust fund and the allocation of support, facilities and a platform to give visibility and a voice, at the international and national levels, to victims of racial discrimination, including, but not limited to, the Dalits, Roma and Afro-Latins.

Post-Conference activities:

The launching of a post-Conference publicity campaign, using the media and the Internet to disseminate the ideas, "best practices", recommendations and plans of action coming out of the World Conference;

The facilitation, by the United Nations, of a network of universities around the world to conduct research on issues of racism and engage in cross-cultural exchange and education.

C. Recommendations on World Conference participation

53. The ability of the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance to achieve its objectives of developing action-oriented and practical strategies will depend on the presence, contribution and participation of all actors and sectors of society that have a stake in this process. The World Conference must not only allow, but actively promote and support the participation of those persons who are most affected, excluded and marginalized by racism and intolerance - and who will have the least amount of resources and the least access to the World Conference and to preparatory activities. The World Conference must also promote the participation of those State and non-State actors and institutions that have an impact or influence, positive or negative, on racism.

54. To this end, the Bellagio Consultation recommends that a panel of testimony from victims of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and intolerance, be scheduled on the agenda of the main (government) conference. The objective is to give groups and individuals a platform from which to make their issues, concerns and expectations known and to underscore the purpose of the World Conference and the work that will be undertaken there. The panel will also make visible those manifestations of racism that are currently invisible or are being denied.

55. The Bellagio Consultation also recommends special meetings at the main conference for actors and sectors of society that do not traditionally participate in world conferences but are critical to this World Conference against Racism. These include national institutions, law enforcement and immigration officials, politicians and parliamentarians, municipal authorities and human relations commissions, multilateral financial institutions and development banks, transnational and private corporations, media and Internet companies, trade unions and educational institutions.

56. Affirming the role and status of NGOs as partners in the World Conference process is critical to the overall success and significance of the World Conference against Racism, particularly as Governments will require the mobilized efforts of NGOs to put the World Conference strategies into action. In the discussions on "lessons learned" from the past, participants confirmed that the failure to provide adequately for the contributions of NGOs seriously undermined the objectives and the effectiveness of recent world conferences. They also confirmed that successful outcomes resulted when "best practices" were used which allowed Governments to take fuller advantage of NGO contributions, as in the recent Diplomatic Conference on the Establishment of an International Criminal Court ("Rome Conference").

57. The Bellagio Consultation recommends that the World Conference against Racism follow the successful model of the Rome Conference and ensure that NGOs have the information and assistance necessary for their participation; have adequate time and facilities for meetings; and have access to all main (government) conference meetings and drafting sessions. In order to ensure that all relevant actors are allowed and encouraged to participate in the World Conference process, the Bellagio Consultation recommends that the Economic and Social Council and the General Assembly adopt the following draft resolution on guidelines for conference participation:

The World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance should provide the opportunity to participate to all persons who are affected by, or have an impact on, these issues. The World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance will be open to the widest possible participation of Governments, national institutions, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), grassroots organizations, organizations of indigenous peoples or minorities, community-based groups, cultural or religious institutions, and other sectors of civil society, including:

(i) Any NGO in consultative status with the Economic and Social Council;

(ii) Any NGO or group accredited to participate in the regional or preparatory meetings for the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance;

(iii) Any NGO or group which participated in any of the United Nations world conferences, or their regional or preparatory meetings, held in the past 10 years, including the Diplomatic Conference on the Establishment of an International Criminal Court and its preparatory meetings;

(iv) Any NGO or group which has participated in the sessions of the Commission on Human Rights, the Sub-Commission on Human Rights, or any of their Working Groups;

(v) Any other NGO or group which has an interest in the subject matter of the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, can provide the Secretariat with a copy of its constitution, and can demonstrate that it is committed to the purposes and principles of the United Nations, may participate if it applies in writing to the Secretariat.

D. Recommendations on the regional preparatory process

58. In addition to broad-based participation at the World Conference against Racism, another significant factor that will determine the overall impact of the World Conference is the regional preparatory process. Most of the substantive work on the World Conference agenda, issues and goals must be completed before the actual conference in 2001. Regional preparatory activities are the vehicle by which specific problems of racism can be identified, "best practices" and successful models for combating racism can be examined, concrete strategies can be formulated, and consensus and broad-based participation can be mobilized.

59. Regional preparatory activities, including preparatory conferences, expert meetings and consultation and satellite meetings, should be strongly urged and supported by the World Conference Preparatory Committee, and adequate resources should be allocated to hold them, as a necessary part of the World Conference. The regional preparatory conferences should be inward-looking and should result in concrete and practical plans of action, with attending mechanisms for implementation, that can be fed into the World Conference, as well as pursued independently in the region.

CONCLUSION

60. There has been progress made in the struggle against racism - the host country of the World Conference, South Africa, providing the most obvious recent example. However, serious and systemic problems still persist. These problems are global, but they require specific strategies, concrete goals and committed action at the international, regional, national, local and individual levels. The World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance is an important opportunity to build upon the achievements of the past and provide a global vision for the future - a vision of a world without racism that embraces all people and that promotes equality, diversity and justice.

Bellagio Consultation participants

Mr. Bertrand Ramcharan (Guyana)
Deputy United Nations Commissioner for Human Rights

Dr. Aklog Birara (Ethiopia)
Senior Adviser on Racial Equality, The World Bank

Dr. Myrna Cunningham (Nicaragua)
Dean, Universidad de las Regiones Autonomous de la Costa Caribe Nicaraguense (URACCAN)

Ms. Dayna Cunningham (United States)
Associate Director, Working Communities, The Rockefeller Foundation

Mr. N. Paul Divakar (India)
National Convenor, National Campaign on Dalit Human Rights (SAKSHI)

Ms. Nimalka Fernando (Sri Lanka)
President, International Movement Against All Forms of Discrimination and Racism (IMADR)

Prof. Yash Ghai (Kenya)
Sir Y K Pao Professor of Public Law, University of Hong Kong

Ms. Noeleen Heyzer (Singapore)
Director, United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM)

Mr. Douwe Korff (Netherlands)
Course Director and Fellow, University of Essex

Prof. Bongani Majola (South Africa)
National Director, Legal Resources Centre

Ms. Gay J. McDougall (United States)
Member, Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
Executive Director, International Human Rights Law Group

Dr. Kumi Naidoo (South Africa)
Secretary General and Chief Executive Officer, CIVICUS: World Alliance for Citizen Participation

Dr. Claire Nelson (Jamaica)
Operations Officer, Caribbean Division, Inter-American Development Bank
President and Founder, Institute of Caribbean Studies

Prof. Paul Nchoji Nkwi (Cameroon)
Project Coordinator, Ethno-Net Africa
Founder, Pan African Anthropology Association

Mr. John Payton, Esq. (United States)
Civil Rights Litigator, Wilmer, Cutler and Pickering

Dr. Dulce Maria Pereira (Brazil)
President, Palmares Cultural Foundation, Ministry of Culture (Brazil)

Dr. Prof. Dimitrina Petrova (Bulgaria)
Executive Director, European Roma Rights Centre

Mr. Alan Phillips (United Kingdom)
Executive Director, Minority Rights Group International

Prof. Paulo Sérgio Pinheiro (Brazil)
Member, Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights
Director, Centre for the Study of Violence, University of Sao Paulo

Rev. N. Barney Pityana (South Africa)
Chair, South African Human Rights Commission

Ms. Nelia Sancho (Philippines)
Coordinator, Asian Women's Human Rights Council

Mr. Pierre Sané (Senegal)
Secretary General, Amnesty International

Ms. Alison N. Stewart (United States)
Special Projects Coordinator, International Human Rights Law Group

Mr. Theo van Boven (Netherlands)
Member, Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Ms. Lynn Walker Huntley (United States)
Director, Comparative Human Relations Initiative, Southern Education Foundation, Inc.

Ms. Laurie Wiseberg (Canada)
Executive Director, Human Rights Internet

Mr. Todd Freier (United States)
Program Administrator, International Human Rights Law Group

Notes

[1] The report of this meeting, entitled The Persistence and Mutation of Racism, is due to be published in February 2000.

[2] Importantly, the Convention provides that "special measures", such as affirmative action, taken for the purpose of securing equality for certain groups, do not constitute racial (or "reverse") discrimination.

[3] Although distinctions made by States between citizens and non-citizens are excluded from the operation of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (by article 1.2), such distinctions can still constitute racial discrimination, albeit outside the purview of the Convention. In fact, the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination has found that discrimination in the *granting* of citizenship can fall within the ambit of the Convention.